



**QUEEN'S
UNIVERSITY
BELFAST**

Whole Child Development Mapping Project in Western Europe and North America: The UK (1)

MacKenzie, A., O'Keeffe, J., & Thurston, A. (2017). Whole Child Development Mapping Project in Western Europe and North America: The UK (1). Queen's University Belfast.

Document Version:

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

Queen's University Belfast - Research Portal:

[Link to publication record in Queen's University Belfast Research Portal](#)

Publisher rights

© 2017 Queen's University Belfast.

This work is made available online in accordance with the publisher's policies. Please refer to any applicable terms of use of the publisher.

General rights

Copyright for the publications made accessible via the Queen's University Belfast Research Portal is retained by the author(s) and / or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing these publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

Take down policy

The Research Portal is Queen's institutional repository that provides access to Queen's research output. Every effort has been made to ensure that content in the Research Portal does not infringe any person's rights, or applicable UK laws. If you discover content in the Research Portal that you believe breaches copyright or violates any law, please contact openaccess@qub.ac.uk.

A photograph of two young girls sitting at a wooden desk in a library. The girl on the left is wearing a red sweater with a crest and is looking down at an open book. The girl on the right is wearing a black blazer over a white shirt and a blue tie, and is also looking at the book. They are both smiling and appear to be engaged in reading. In the background, there are shelves filled with books. A semi-transparent text box is overlaid on the left side of the image.

Whole Child Development Mapping Project in Western Europe and North America:

The UK

School of Social Science, Education & Social Work,
Queen's University, Belfast by Alison MacKenzie, Joanne
O'Keeffe & Allen Thurston

Whole Child Development Mapping Project in Western Europe and North America

The UK

Queen's University, Belfast

Alison MacKenzie

Joanne O'Keeffe

Allen Thurston

Contents

Research Overview.....	Error! Bookmark not defined.	-4
Methods		4
Participants		5
Results		5-8
Implications		8-11
References.....		11
Appendices		11-12

Site Visit Overview

Graham Donaldson, University of Glasgow, UK: Key architect of curricular reform in Scotland, Curriculum for Excellence (CfE), in nursery, primary and secondary, and Initial Education Programmes in all universities. CfE privileges learning and the holistic understanding of what it means to be a young Scot; aims to close the attainment gap, and ensure progression in literacy, numeracy and wellbeing. A central component of CfE is Health and Wellbeing which is embedded across the curriculum. The purpose of the curriculum is to enable each child and young person to develop the capabilities and attributes of ‘successful learners’, ‘confident individuals’, ‘responsible citizens’, and ‘effective contributors’, which together are known as the 4 Capacities,

Scottish Youth Parliament, Edinburgh: This site was identified because it is the democratically elected voice of Scottish young people, aged 11-26, who are represented by 167 SYPs, drawn from across Scotland to serve a two year term. The vision of the SYP is to create a nation that actively listens to, and values, the meaningful participation of its children and young people in order to ensure Scotland is the best place in the world in which to grow up. It is a youth-led, fully accountable, human rights-based organisation whose values are based on the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (UNCRC). Their purpose embodies Article 12: that young people have the right to express their views freely and have their opinions listened to in all matters affecting them.

Orchestras for All, London, UK: The work of this organisation is aimed at reducing the barriers to performing in ensemble music making, especially for young people from disadvantaged backgrounds across the UK. OfA reached out to 900 youth in its first five years.

Whole Education, London, UK: WE is a nation-wide partnership of 200 primary and secondary schools and organisations committed to redefining educational offerings in

England for children and young people. WE describes itself as a community of practice engaging in a variety of pedagogical practices such *Flipped Learning*. Based on the theory of *Spirals of Change* WE aim to help children and young people develop a range of skills, qualities and knowledge they will need to succeed in life, learning and work; to make learning more relevant and engaging, with young people taking ownership of their own learning; and to support learning across various settings (online, outside, at home, through volunteering and work) while engaging the wider community.

Relational Schools, Cambridge, UK: RS focus on nurturing and developing positive relationships as part of a values-based relational strategy to improve student outcomes across secondary schools in the East Anglian region of England. RS employ the *Relational Proximity Framework* to assess classroom relations. The vision of RS is to help overcome social inequality by implementing approaches that value the importance of developing good relationships for excellent educational attainment for young people. RS embody character values of honesty, justice, respect, and care. RS also places a priority on values that sustain relational capital, including forgiveness, reconciliation, and the teaching of relational skills.

Methods

We conducted interviews at the headquarters of each organisation. The only exception was Graham Donaldson who was interviewed at Edinburgh airport. There were no observations. The interviews were recorded and transcribed with the consent of the interviewees. The interview schedule (see Appendix A) was based on the three research questions posed by AIR. The same questions were put to each institution but follow-up questions focused on the specific content of what each interviewee discussed about the aims, goals, vision and challenges of their institution.

Participants

Graham Donaldson, Honorary Professor, University of Glasgow, policy advisor to the Scottish and Welsh governments, and specialist advisor OECD.

Scottish Youth Parliament: Two interviewees: Jamie Dunlop, Depute Chief Executive of The Scottish Youth Parliament, and Terri Smyth, Member of the Scottish Youth Parliament (MSYP).

Orchestras for All: Three interviewees: Marianne Haye, Chief Executive, Stuart Burns, Head of Operations, and Anna Williams, Modular Programme Manager

Whole Education: Two interviewees: Douglas Archibald, Director, and Tal Rafaeli, Communications Director.

Relational Schools: Two interviewees: Rob Loe, Executive Director, and John Ashcroft, Research Director.

Results

Graham Donaldson, CfE:

Relevant WCD Domain and population served – All domains; all children and young people aged 3-18.

Institution type: Formal

QIs – All are covered by the reforms to the curriculum and by The Children and Young People (Scotland) Act 2014

A key component of the curriculum is Health and Wellbeing for which every teacher is responsible and which is embedded across every subject. Allied to curricular reform is The Children and Young People (Scotland) Act 2014 whose aim is the wellbeing of children and young people in Scotland. The Act is wide ranging and includes *Getting it right for every child (GIRFEC)*. Here, wellbeing is described using eight indicators, the so-called SHANARRI indicators: Safe (protected from abuse); Health (highest attainable standards of physical and mental health); Achieving (development of skills, confidence and self-esteem, at

home, in school and in the community); Nurtured (having a nurturing place to live in a family setting, with additional help if needed); Active (having opportunities to take part in activities such as play, recreation and sport); Respected (being heard and consulted on decisions that affect young people); Responsible (having opportunities and encouragement to play active and responsible roles at home, in school and in the community); Included (having help to overcome social, educational, physical and economic inequalities).

Because of the impact of CfE in Scotland, The Welsh Assembly commissioned Graham Donaldson to effect similar reform in its education system in Wales. Reform has been ongoing for the past three to four years.

Scottish Youth Parliament:

Relevant WCD Domain and population served – Positive Youth

Development/Engagement and Connectedness, diverse population, sex 50-50, ages 11-26

Organisation type: Formal

QIs. Predominantly 2-5

Significant impact across Scotland. There is a new campaign each year chosen by the MSYPs. The success of the *Love Equally* for gay marriage campaign resulted in the historic decision to legalise same-sex marriage in Scotland with the Marriage and Civil Partnership (Scotland) Bill in 2014. The Love Equally Campaign won Campaign of the Year at the Scottish Charity of the Year Awards. The current campaign is on Mental Health, *Speak Your Mind*, the objective of which is to raise awareness of mental health among young people and to reduce stigma associated with this illness. SYP provides a lot of training to their SYPs to enable them to be activists and advocates for young people's rights. The SYP has a very good relationship with the UNCRC committee in Geneva. Representatives went to Geneva to give evidence against the Scottish government on the state of children's rights in Scotland. 70,000

young people voted in the 2017 Scottish Youth Parliament Elections to choose their new representatives.

Orchestras for All

Relevant WCD Domain and population served – Artistic Development, diverse mix, sex 50-50, ages 11-18

Organisation type: Formal

QIs. Predominantly 1, 3, 4, 5 and 6

Aim to reach disadvantaged young people. There are no auditions or selection processes; participants are selected based on commitment and dedication to music in some kind of challenging circumstance. OfA create bespoke arrangements in response to the needs of players, embrace all musical genres, and involve young players as co-creators of musical compositions.

Whole Education

Relevant WCD Domain and population served – All. The network of 200 schools focus on different aspects of WCD, diverse mix, sex 50-50, ages 3-19

Organisation type: Formal

QIs. All

WE describes itself as a community of practice engaging in a variety of pedagogical practices such *Flipped Learning*. Based on the theory of *Spirals of Change* WE aim to help children and young people develop a range of skills, qualities and knowledge they will need to succeed in life, learning and work; to make learning more relevant and engaging, with young people taking ownership of their own learning; and to support learning across various settings (online, outside, at home, through volunteering and work) while engaging the wider community. There are 14 networks that include interest groups such as *Leadership*, *Student*

Leadership, and Engaging Parents in the Wider Community. All are aimed at fostering whole child development approaches.

Relational Schools

Relevant WCD Domain and population served – PEHS, Spiritual Development, Positive Youth Development, Engagement and Connectedness, and Academic Learning, diverse mix, sex 50-50, ages 10-18.

Organisation type: Formal

QIs. All

Collected from schools in areas of deprivation, research based on surveys of over 3000 students reveal that educational attainment has surpassed those in more advantaged settings. The *Relational Proximity Framework*, which measures how well two people engages with the emotions and behaviour of the other, relational schools have higher levels of wellbeing, lower levels of bullying, and improved physical health. The main challenge for RS is that they are working over capacity and need to expand.

Implications

CfE: Promising practices: include promoting WCD are the focus on Health and Wellbeing and the SHANARRI indicators. Reform is comprehensive and ongoing and is aimed at ensuring that every aspect of the child's wellbeing is catered for from social and emotional wellbeing to good educational outcomes and career/educational progression (see transcript 1, Graham Donaldson).

Sustainability: Because of the amount of support material and guidance notes provided to teachers there has been a growth in bureaucracy which has resulted in subject 'audits' whereby teachers assess whether their subject meets the 4 Capacities, SHANARRI indicators, depth and breadth, and so on, and whether there is 'evidence' to show that teachers are adhering to the principles and values of the curriculum. Approaches to planning and assessment are also bureaucratic, which is the antithesis of what was intended when CfE

was devised and implemented. Action is being taken to address these issues to discourage over-bureaucratisation.

Scottish Youth Parliament: Promising practices: there are very many, including the voices of young people, taking those voices seriously, engaging in nationwide campaigns each year, consulting with the Scottish Parliament, regular elections to the SYP, active training and support for new members, instilling confidence, self-esteem and a sense of empowerment in young people from disadvantaged backgrounds in particular (see transcript 2, Terri Smyth, SYP).

Assessment: The SPY regularly produces reports on the outcomes of their campaigns. During the campaign on mental health, 1483 young people, between the ages of 12-26 took part in a questionnaire on awareness of mental health information, support, and services. SYPs develop confidence, communication skills and a sense of responsibility. They also, because of the campaigns, develop an awareness of the effects of injustice and inequality, and their role in addressing those issues. MSYPs return to their communities and usually continue their campaigns work. Ten former MSYPs are now local authority councillors (see transcript 3, Jamie Dunlop).

Sustainability: The challenges to sustainability arise from funding. The SYP receives £325,000 from the Scottish Government on a three year cycle. Turnover is £500,000 so the SYP are looking to diversify sources of funding (see transcript 3).

Orchestras for All: Promising practices: OfA reach out to children from disadvantaged backgrounds to instil a love of music of all kinds and to show that music is for everyone. The emphasis is on effort rather than performance. Professional volunteers work with the children. OfA create bespoke arrangements in response to the needs of players, embrace all musical genres, and involve young players as co-creators of musical compositions. OfA provide logistical, emotional, practical, artistic support to ensure that,

regardless of the barrier young people face, they can take part in the activities free of charge (see transcript 4 OfAll). Participants are placed, as far as possible, on university campuses giving the young people the opportunity to be in university halls and experience university. OfA have a long running partnership with the University of Leeds at which they do their 4-day residential summer course (see transcript 4).

Assessment: Based on research commissioned by OfA (see transcript 4), participants reported improved confidence and self-esteem, improved ability to self-reflect, improved communication skills and greater inspiration and motivation.

Sustainability: The challenge for OfA is funding. Ensemble music is an expensive activity, as are the instruments - ensemble music making workshops and residential courses are free of charge to the young people. The cost of the national orchestra is about £1500 per person and the Modulo is about £100 per person. A great deal of time is spent finding sources of funding and in donor maintenance of which there are about 20-30. £300,000 raised each year in funding. OfA would like to expand their reach to include more diverse range of children such as refugee children and children in care (see transcript 4, OfAll).

Whole Education: Promising Practices: Helping children and young people develop the skills, qualities and knowledge they will need to thrive in the learning life and work. Making learning more relevant and engaging for young people so that they own their own learning. Supporting learning in and out of the classroom, working with parents, local community and local partners to provide an engaging learning experience (see transcript 5, WE).

Assessment: In terms of their impact on WCD, a pilot project of 12 schools reported that there was improved progress in reading, increased attendance in extra-curricular activities and more accommodation of challenge. In terms of impact for leadership and

professional learning, there was more purposeful collaboration and increased reading and use of research (see transcript 5, WE).

Sustainability: At present, WE is operating at full capacity and have no plans to expand beyond England. The challenge is to maintain funding and increase their income from £900,000 to £1million (see interview transcript 5 and Whole Education site Visit).

Relational Schools: Promising practices: RS use current research to underpin their approaches to improved student-student and teacher-student relationships. They aim to help children understand the dynamics of relationships, and to learn the benefits of compromise and negotiation by addressing the issues that arise from social isolation and individualism such as low self-esteem, self-harm and suicide. They seek to nourish tolerance and empathy (see RS Site Visit). Because RS encourage researchers to understand how the school can simulate the home environment, the organisation has gravitated towards young people who come from disadvantaged backgrounds or fractured home lives (see transcript 6). RS are working with 16,000 children across five states in Australia beginning in 2017, made possible because many of their tools are going online which students can access anywhere in the world.

Assessment: Collected from schools in areas of deprivation, research based on surveys of over 3000 students reveal that educational attainment has surpassed those in more advantaged settings. The *Relational Proximity Framework*, which measures how well two people engages with the emotions and behaviour of the other, demonstrates that relational schools have increased levels of wellbeing, reduced levels of bullying, and improved physical health. RS are beginning their first longitudinal studies of teacher training to understand the kinds of relationships a teacher needs to feel secure and supported, and thrive in the profession. They are mapping 120 trainees in 2 cohorts, with the first cohort being measured over 5 years (see transcript 6).

Sustainability: The main challenge for RS is that they are working over capacity and need to expand.

References

Transcript 1 Graham Donaldson

Transcript 2 Terri Smyth, SYP

Transcript 3 Jamie Dunlop

Transcript 4 OfAll

Transcript 5 WE

Orchestras for All Site Visit

RS Site Visit

SYP Site Visit

Whole Education Site Visit

Appendices

Appendix A: Interview Schedule

Interview questions

- (1) What are the promising practices for promoting whole child development?
 - a. Can you give any examples of practices that seem to be effective at promoting whole child development?
 - i. What are the practices?
 - ii. How were they effective?
 - iii. What changes did you observe?
 - b. How does your school/setting/research/policy promote health and wellbeing in children?
 - i. Is there a policy (could we have a copy)?
 - ii. Are outside agencies used?
 - iii. What specific initiatives are being used in the school/setting/policy/research?
 - c. How does your school/setting/research/policy promote socio-emotional development in children?
- (2) What assessments (if any) are being used as part of whole child development programs?
 - a. Are you using any assessments that give indicators of whole child development (list and name)?
 - i. What assessments that are not linked to school attainment are used?

- ii. Is whole child development taken into account in planning curriculum/policy/delivery?
 - b. How do you evaluate the success of the work/campaigns you are involved in?
- (3) What action steps (if any) do schools and organizations take to enable sustainability and scalability of programs?
- a. What resource and training investment has there been in establishing and perpetuating whole child development programmes?
 - i. What costs were involved?
 - ii. How frequently does training need updated?
 - b. What evidence is there to underpin whole child development programmes used/recommended?
 - c. Are any self-evaluation mechanisms linked to the use of whole child development programmes?

Notes:

Questions will be varied slightly dependent upon context, for example:

- whole person, rather than whole child at the Scottish Youth Parliament;
- organisation rather than school at Orchestras for All;
- for question 2 above either question a or b will be asked
- challenges confronting each institution and how they are resolved
- implementation of policy/programme